

EVALUATION DU NIVEAU D'INTEGRATION DE LA DISCIPLINE MARKETING AU SEIN D'UNE ENTREPRISE PUBLIQUE CAS DE L'UNITE ALCOST (C&H)

Pr. Abdenour NOURI, Président du laboratoire *MARKETIC*, HEC
Fahima BOUMEDDA-TIAB, Maître assistante, Université de Béjaïa

Résumé: L'omniprésence des produits étrangers a affecté le tissu économique local dont le secteur textile/confection. A cet effet, pour y remédier, le gouvernement algérien mise sur une politique de relance, fondée essentiellement sur la valorisation de la consommation locale. Dans cette perspective, le présent papier tente à évaluer les actions marketing entreprises et à entreprendre par une PME telle que «Alcost» afin de promouvoir le *made in Algeria*. Toutefois, les résultats de notre enquête ont révélé qu'en dépit de l'aide financière de l'Etat et de la volonté de certains employés de l'entreprise en question, le véritable état d'esprit marketing demeure défaillant.

Mots-clés: Relance du secteur, marketing, consommation locale, reconquête du consommateur, made in Algeria.

Introduction:

Le passage de l'Algérie d'une économie planifiée à une économie de marché a incité les entreprises algériennes à repenser leurs stratégies, leur mode d'organisation ainsi que leur mode de gestion, et d'omettre les anciennes pratiques centralisées. En effet, il est universellement admis que l'économie planifiée a été incapable d'assurer la croissance économique et d'offrir un minimum de prospérité ou même de sécurité économique aux populations (Watts, 2007). Cependant, les réformes économiques engagées depuis 1988 à travers plusieurs textes de lois (MEKIDECHE, 2000) ont causé d'énormes bouleversements sur le paysage économique algérien et sur le secteur textile/habillement en particulier.

Cela dit, l'ouverture de l'Algérie sur l'ère internationale a engendré des phénomènes qui ont constitué, à un certain temps, une entrave pour la relance

du secteur ³. Avec l'afflux des produits étrangers (chinois, turcs, syriens... etc.) sur le marché national, les marques locales sont marginalisées. Il s'avère que les entreprises de confection de l'habillement ont des difficultés à subvenir aux besoins des consommateurs algériens et en particulier à ceux des jeunes adolescents et adultes. Ainsi, pour pouvoir revoir la façon d'appréhender le marché, le recours à la discipline marketing devient inéluctable (connaître les processus de choix des consommateurs, s'adapter aux offres innovantes des concurrents étrangers...).

A cet effet, pour y remédier, l'Etat décida de subventionner les entreprises en difficulté et prit l'initiative de dresser un cahier de charges stimulant et appelant à la valorisation du '*made in Algérie*'. A cet égard, l'une des entreprises ayant tiré avantage est l'entreprise publique Alcost. Tout au long du présent papier, nous avons essayé de tracer ses pratiques marketing développées et d'évaluer le degré d'application de celles-ci.

C'est dans cette perspective que s'inscrit notre problématique: **Quelles sont les pratiques marketing adoptées par une entreprise publique telle que «Alcost» afin de reconquérir le consommateur algérien?** Pour parvenir à y répondre, la méthodologie choisie est basée sur une étude exploratoire qualitative, au niveau de l'unité Alcost, auprès de certains responsables (qui interviennent à des niveaux différents au sein de l'entreprise), où nous avons opté pour un échantillon à choix raisonné en utilisant comme outil, l'entretien individuel semi-directif; nous avons eu recours à des techniques d'interrogation appropriées telles que: des questions ouvertes sans structure, des questions fermées, des associations et des compléments de phrase. Quant à la méthode d'analyse des données recueillies, nous avons jugé que le résumé est la forme d'analyse la plus adéquate suite à l'absence d'enregistrements des entretiens (JOLIBERT et JOURDAN, 2006).

1. Aperçu sur l'utilité de la discipline marketing pour les entreprises:

En dépit des divergences des deux courants déterministe (le marketing est fonction du niveau de développement du pays et les pays en voie de développement ne sont pas prédisposés à parler marketing) et activiste (le marketing constitue un facteur actif de développement économique), le marketing reste le lien ombilical entre l'entreprise et le consommateur; et la

³ Apparition de nouvelles technologies, en particulier dans le domaine de l'information et de la communication; exigence accrue, des consommateurs algériens (non-conformité des produits: prix, qualité, effet de mode, etc.), le marché informel; la concurrence des marques étrangère une dépendance majeure aux importations des matières premières, l'endettement, et la déstructuration du secteur par l'importation des produits contrefaits et de friperie.

maîtrise de ses grandeurs procure le plus grand bien aux deux parties prenantes. En outre, le marketing ne suit pas le développement économique du pays, mais il est le vecteur même de ce développement (HOSLEY et WEE, 1988). En effet, Peter Drucker qui est l'un des pionniers du courant activiste, l'a corroboré en considérant le marketing comme vecteur de développement économique (pour des pays développés ou en voie de développement).

Le marketing est d'essence pragmatique (LENDREVIE et LEVY, 2014); où le marketeur a pour finalité de pouvoir exercer de l'influence en sa faveur sur le comportement de la cible visée, et se propose de lui offrir un produit ou un service dont la valeur est supérieure à celle des concurrents (valeur perçue). En effet, il doit repenser, sans cesse, sa stratégie et envisager tout ce qu'il entreprend avec vigilance et dans une perspective globale. En effet, actuellement, les entreprises sont confrontées, d'une manière ou d'une autre, à une rude concurrence internationale et doivent avoir une orientation mondiale afin de faire face à des consommateurs de plus en plus méfiants, avertis et exigeants.

En effet, aujourd'hui, l'entreprise est confrontée à plusieurs tendances marquant les sociétés et orientant ainsi les choix des consommateurs, telles que: l'accomplissement, la recherche de personnalisation, la recherche d'émotion, le lien social, l'importance de la nostalgie, la rassurance, la simplicité, l'abandon de la propriété, la disparition des frontières et la vertu (DESCOMBES, 2002).

A cet effet, l'étude du comportement du consommateur constitue l'une des prérogatives de la discipline marketing, qui procure des éléments de réponse précieux pour la conduite d'une stratégie marketing efficace (VERNETTE, 2001).

Comme l'explique Sam Walton : *«le seul vrai patron, c'est le client, il peut jeter tout le monde à la rue, depuis le P-D-G jusqu'au manutentionnaire: il lui suffit pour cela d'aller dépenser son argent ailleurs!»* (ARMSTRONG et KOTLER, 2007).

2. Genèse de la discipline marketing en Algérie:

La discipline marketing était méconnue; les entreprises ne fournissaient d'efforts que pour produire davantage afin de satisfaire une demande basique et excédentaire. En outre, cette discipline n'était même pas dispensée dans les universités. Ce n'est qu'à partir des années 80 que celle-ci a fait objet d'enseignement à l'école supérieure du commerce d'Alger.

4 Fondateur de Wall-Mart, la plus grande entreprise de distribution au monde.

3. ALCOST comme acteur de la promotion du made in Algeria:

Dans un contexte économique si hostile et avec un taux de chômage élevé, la consommation locale semble le moyen le plus approprié pour relancer le dynamisme économique et ainsi créer des emplois. Comme nous l'avons déjà cité, *in supra*, l'entreprise Alcost est l'un des acteurs du projet de la valorisation du made in Algeria, au sein de laquelle nous avons essayé d'évaluer les pratiques marketing.

3.1.La dimension philosophique du marketing:

A partir des entretiens, il s'est avéré qu'aucune étude de marché n'a été et ni sera effectuée auprès des consommateurs sous prétexte de la cherté de l'enquête, du manque d'un personnel spécialisé dans le domaine et aussi et surtout de la non fiabilité des résultats. Il nous a été, aussi, révélé que plusieurs décisions sont centralisées à des niveaux hiérarchiques supérieurs et que les différents services de l'établissement ne travaillent pas en concertation.

3.2.La démarche stratégique de l'entreprise Alcost:

L'entreprise dispose de plusieurs domaines d'activités stratégiques, adressés principalement aux professionnels (les policiers, les agents de la commune, les banquiers etc.) qui se portent relativement bien. Néanmoins, ALCOST est déterminée à se repositionner sur le marché local en s'appuyant sur la qualité et le prix des produits et ce afin, non seulement, de reconquérir la confiance et l'intérêt du consommateur algérien mais aussi d'attirer l'attention des investisseurs étrangers.

Pour ce faire, en termes de segmentation marketing, l'entreprise a opté pour une segmentation sociodémographique dont le critère utilisé est la catégorie socioprofessionnelle. Sa cible sera constituée de toutes les tranches d'âges, femmes et hommes percevant un revenu important ou moyen.

3.3.La démarche opérationnelle du marketing au sein d'Alcost:

A présent, nous tracerons et évaluerons le plan de marchéage classique de l'entreprise Alcost, à travers les 4P de McCarthy.

-La politique de produit:

En dépit du retard relatif à la concrétisation du contenu du pacte prévu avec les partenaires turcs, ALCOST insiste sur l'importance de reconduire le consommateur algérien en particulier vers la consommation locale et de promouvoir le made in Algeria à l'étranger. En outre ALCOST, s'engage à faire face à la ringardise en commençant d'abord à utiliser les matières

premières de qualité, dont les exigences sont tracées dans une fiche technique élaborée par l'entreprise, et accompagnée de certificats de conformité. Par ailleurs, les tests de la composition des matières premières se feront au niveau du laboratoire CNTC de Boumer des. Au final, l'entreprise se montre soucieuse quant à l'intérêt du consommateur en accentuant ses efforts sur un marketing présumé sociétal via un produit dit 'sûr'.

Dès lors, l'entreprise est en pleine phase de transition afin d'atteindre ses objectifs. Elle a acquis et en voie d'acquisition de plusieurs technologies et d'équipements sophistiqués. En ce moment elle essaye de développer et de monter une nouvelle collection saisonnière adressée au grand public, pour ce faire, plusieurs formations sont en cours de programmation: formation en marketing et commercialisation, stylisme et modélisme... Quant au choix de la marque, qui sera attribuée à cette collection, se fera en concertation avec les partenaires turcs.

A cet effet, elle est aussi sur un programme de certification ISO 9001/2008 basé sur la mise en place d'un système de management de la qualité. Au-delà de cette certification, l'entreprise doit respecter le cahier des charges établi par l'ISGP IM pour pouvoir utiliser le label made in Algeria qui doit incarner la garantie promise aux consommateurs. Cette garantie est apportée par l'intervention systématique d'un organisme certificateur IANOR dont la procédure d'attribution est traduite dans un cahier des charges selon certains critères.

Cela dit, dans la grande consommation, le made in Algeria seul ne réussit pas si l'on n'est pas au même prix que ses concurrents et si on n'est pas innovant. Il s'agit pour Alcost de relever le défi de fabriquer en Algérie en offrant des produits de meilleure qualité accompagnée d'un prix attractif. Pour ce faire, l'entreprise vise la productivité à travers l'acquisition de nouveaux équipements et de nouvelles technologies telles que : TAO (tracés assistés par ordinateur), CAO (coupes assistées par ordinateur), projeter la GPAO (gestion de la production assistée par ordinateur), le progiciel ERP...etc.

-La politique de prix:

Deux stratégies de fixation de prix sont prévues; une stratégie de pénétration pour une cible percevant un revenu plus au moins moyen, ainsi qu'une stratégie d'écémage destinée à une catégorie de consommateurs dont le revenu atteint ou dépasse un certain seuil.

-La politique de communication:

La politique de communication d'ALCOST tourne autour des relations publiques telles que la participation aux foires nationales et internationales,

réception de stagiaires, de chercheurs et l'organisation d'un défilé de mode relatif à la nouvelle collection prévue. Cependant, elle compte confectionner un catalogue, des brochures, des prospectus...etc. et elle est sur un projet de création d'un site web en sous-traitance avec une boîte française.

-La politique de distribution:

Selon les entretiens, l'entreprise ALCOST dispose d'un circuit de distribution court en passant par les détaillants (vendeurs en magasin...) et d'une force de vente sédentaire. Cependant, il est à signaler que la plupart des vendeurs manquent de professionnalisme (refus de facturation, modification des étiquettes des produits d'Alcost...) et afin de résoudre cette situation alarmante et atteindre un chiffre d'affaires de 40% (relatif au grand public), le groupe C&H opta pour une intégration en aval, en créant une filiale de distribution sous le nom «jackets club». En fait, cette dernière ne constitue pas seulement un moyen de distribution directe mais aussi un vecteur de communication amplement indispensable qui sert de banque de données pour l'entreprise (remontée d'informations concernant les besoins, les préférences et les réclamations des consommateurs...etc.).

Conclusion:

En guise de conclusion, promouvoir le label algérien semble constituer l'une des alternatives les plus judicieuses pour affronter la concurrence étrangère. Cependant, c'est l'une des solutions les plus adéquates pour pouvoir récupérer les consommateurs algériens. Ceci-dit, à travers notre enquête quelques constats sont à relever: l'entreprise Alcost ne dispose pas d'une véritable philosophie marketing, malgré les efforts consentis et la volonté de certains de ses responsables, une mauvaise conception de l'organigramme où la dénomination et l'emplacement de certains postes de travail sont inappropriés à la nature des tâches qui leur sont inhérentes.

Dès lors, pour mener à bien sa politique de valorisation du label algérien, Alcost devrait intensifier son réseau de distribution afin de contrôler au mieux les vendeurs, investir dans des études de marché et savoir prendre des risques (afin de comprendre les freins, les motivations, les désirs et les comportements des consommateurs et, plus particulièrement, des jeunes algériens qui constituent une part importante de la population). Le marketing est un effort constant d'adaptation (BAYNAST, LENDREVIE, LEVY, 2017) qui ne se résume pas seulement à l'utilisation de certains outils. Par ailleurs, l'entreprise doit miser sur une communication informative, puis persuasive à travers le *nudge marketing* (SINGLER, 2015) (en essayant de faire converger les motivations des consommateurs d'ordre hédoniste avec les motivations

éthiques et rationnelles), et doit travailler en concertation avec les associations consuméristes telles que: l'association A.D.I.C (association de défense et d'information des consommateurs), en mettant l'accent sur l'adoption d'un marketing sociétal⁵.

Ainsi, dans un contexte de forte globalisation, l'idée d'une politique de production et de consommation locales doit être privilégiée par les entreprises (CAVANAGH, MANDER, 2005). En effet, cette valorisation ne constitue pas seulement un micro objectif de rentabilité des entreprises mais un outil de relance économique pour toute l'Algérie.

Bibliographie

Ouvrages

- ARMSTRONG Gary et KOTLER Philip, *principes de marketing*, Pearson Education France, 2007.
- BAYNAST Arnaud, LENDREVIE Jacques et LEVY (Julien), *Mercator*, 12^{ième} Edition, Dunod, Paris, 2017.
- CAVANAGH John et MANDER Jerry, *Alternatives à la globalisation économique: un monde meilleur est possible*, édition ecosociété, 2005.
- DEBOURG, CLAVELIN Perrier, *pratiques du marketing: le marketing opérationnel, savoir gérer, savoir communiquer, savoir faire*. Edition Bert, Paris, 2003.
- DESCOMBES Laure, «*le marketing des 18-30 ans: la cible des prés-adultes*». Editions EMS, 2002.
- HELPER Jean Pierre et ORSONI Jacques, *le marketing*, 5^{ème} édition. Vuibert,
- JOLIBERT Alain, Jourdan Philip, *marketing research: méthodes de recherche et d'études en marketing*, éditions Dunod, 2006.
- KOTLER Philip, *le marketing selon Kotler ou comment créer, conquérir et dominer un marché ?* Editions Village Mondial, Paris 1999.
- KOTLER Philip et DUBOIS Bernard, *le marketing management*, Edition Publi Union, Paris 2000.
- LAMBIN Jean-Jacques et DE MOERLOOSE Chantal, *marketing stratégique et opérationnel: du marketing à l'orientation marché*, 8^{ième} édition. Dunod, Paris, 2012

5 Alcost et ADIC pourraient, par exemple, mettre en avant les dangers liés à l'utilisation de certains vêtements chinois.

- LENDREVIE Jacques et LEVY (Julien), *Mercator: tout le marketing à l'ère numérique*, 11^{ième} Edition, Dunod, Paris, 2014.
- MEKIDECHE Mustapha, *l'Algérie entre économie de rente et économie émergente*, 2^{ième} édition Dahlab, 2000.
- SINGLER Eric, *Nudge marketing: comment changer efficacement les comportements*, édition village mondial, 2015.
- VAN LAETHEM Nathalie., *toute la fonction marketing*, Edition Dunod, Paris, 2007.
- VERNETTE Eric, *l'essentiel du marketing*, éditions Eyrolles, 3^{ième} édition, 2008.
- VIOT Cathrine, *MEMENTOS I Md, le marketing*, Gualino éditeur, Lextenso édition, 2016.
- WATTS Michael, *l'économie de marché: qu'est-ce qu'une économie de marché?*, Kamal Chehrit & éditions Grand-Alger-Livres, Alger, 2007.

Reuves scientifiques

- BOUHOU Kassim, *l'Algérie des réformes économiques: un goût d'inachevé*, Institut Français des Relations Internationales, 2009.
- BOUYAAKOUB Ahmed, *la difficile adaptation de l'entreprise algérienne aux mécanismes du marché*, in revue du CREAD, n° 39, 1^{ier} trimestre, 1997
- HOSLEY S., WEE C.H., *marketing and economic development focusing on the less development countries*, journal of macromarketing, n°8, 1998.

THE ROLE OF HIGHER EDUCATION ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: THEORY AND EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE FROM THE MENA COUNTRIES

Issam MALKI

Department of Economics and Quantitative Methods
Westminster Business School
University of Westminster, UK

Abstract: The purpose of this paper is to investigate the role of higher education on economic development in the MENA countries. The main question this paper attempts to answer is whether higher education contributes to sustainable development in developing economies. Although the question has been extensively studied by the literature, the conclusions are often found to be contrasting. In other words, the body of empirical evidence does not provide any conclusive positive role of higher education. In this context, we revisit the evidence by (i) accounting for development path of each economies and (ii) employing endogenous growth model. In general, we find that the role of higher education on economic growth is different across countries depending on the country's position on economic development.

Keywords: Economic growth, neoclassical growth model, income convergence, relative clubs of convergence, panel data.

Introduction and Background:

Recent literature on higher education and its role on economic growth prompted an increasingly important question on whether governments should spend on higher education (Aghion et al, 2009). This question, despite the wider interest in the relationship between higher education and economic growth, has resulted conflicting conclusions and little empirical evidence in favour of the positive role higher education plays in economic development.

Nonetheless, a number of studies in the literature acknowledge the important role of higher education, and universities, in improving the economic performance of a country. For example, the literature in Holland *et al* (2013), Benos and Zotou (2013), Holmes (2013), Aghion *et al* (2009), Bils and Klenow (2000), Judson (1998), Gremmell (1996), Benhabib and Spiegel (1994), amongst others, provide empirical evidence on the positive role of higher education on economic growth. In this context, economic theory

suggests the existence of a number of channels and transmission mechanisms through which higher education may affect economic development. In addition to personal return to ones' human capital, higher education may produce several externalities such as technological innovation, research and development making, thus increasing capital and labour productivity leading to higher economic growth.

Thus, the role of higher education institutions, such as universities, is of crucial relevance for higher education to be effective for economic growth. The role of higher education institutions, universities in particular, can be viewed through the following channels: (i) in producing skilled and highly trained labour, (ii) in the role of research and development activities and collaboration with industries and (iii) the entrepreneurial engagement and preparing future graduates to become business leaders through setting up start-up businesses. These roles of higher education institutions have been key in improving productivity in the economy according to Barrell (2010). Indeed, many of the developing economies have focused in the last 25 years their attention to the economic potential of universities and research institution as argued by Kruss et al (2010) and Pillay (2010). There is, however, no wider consensus on whether higher education institutions, and by extension, higher education might stimulate economic growth in the long run and the empirical conclusions can be described -at best- as fragile (Holmes, 2013; Aghion *et al* (2009)).

This lack of conclusive and strong evidence is generally attributed to various reasons. First, many of the previous research raised concerns regarding the quality of the proxies used by researchers to capture the effect of education generally. This has produced consistently contradicting conclusions on the role of education, and more importantly, higher education. For example, Cohen and Soto (2007) argue that measurements of human capital in general suffer from conceptual and empirical problems. At the conceptual level, the literature does not offer any clear definition on how human capital and its types should be represented. Indeed, it has been often the case that years of schooling or the average years of educational attainment are the common proxies to capture the role of human capital in economic growth. The use of such proxies may lead to erroneous conclusions about the role the various types of education since the years of schooling do not necessarily capture the contribution of higher education. This is because not all members of the society chose to acquire a higher education degree. Moreover, these proxies assume that the effect of primary education is the same as the effect of higher education (including PhD and Masters levels), which does not seem to capture the effect of the mechanism to which investment in education is linked to economic growth (Aghion *et al*, 2009). In

addition, the empirical literature such as in Cohen and Soto (2007), De la Fuente and Domenech (2002, 2006) and Krueger and Lindahl (2001), show that the data in many countries suffer from quality and reliability issues leading to measurement errors.

Second, the effect of higher education may be affected by how developed, fast-growing and rich is the economy. This is because, as argued by Aghion et al (2009), a country's education investments are non-random, which implies that the economies with better infrastructure and superior institutions may find it easy to expand on their higher education spending. In this case, economies with low economic growth or growing by slower rates may experience a negative relationship between economic growth and higher education spending (Bils and Klenow, 2000). In other words, the speed at which an economy grows reflects the rate at which it absorbs available technology, and human capital is no different in this case. Thus, one may assume that the impact of higher education may be related to the convergence rate of an economy to the steady state level. In this context, one may investigate the performance of higher education by accounting for the position of the long run time path of growth of an economy.

In this paper, we focus on the latter issue. We propose a two-stage approach to study the impact of higher education on economic growth. We first study the dynamic nature of economic development in the MENA countries by means of the concept of income convergence. The concept of income convergence studies whether a set of economies converge to the same long run level over time. The concept has been extended to include several types of convergence including absolute and conditional convergence [Barro and Sala-i-Martin (1992); Bernard and Durlauf, (1996)], beta and sigma convergence [Barro and Sala-i-Martin (1992), Baddeley et al (2006)] and more recently the concept of clubs of convergence. This latter type of convergence refers to two variations that exist in the recent literature. The first is introduced by Chatterji (1992) and Quah (1997), which refers to the presence of two clubs that distinguish between rich and poor economies. The second variation has been introduced recently by Phillips and Sul (2007) that allows modelling and analysing economic transition behaviour under the presence of common growth characteristics consistent with neoclassical growth model.

The Phillips and Sul (2007) approach, PS hereafter, provide a very general framework that captures both, the overall convergence and clubs of convergence. Moreover, the number of clubs is defined by the number of steady states that may exist and to which a group of economies of similar convergence rate can be clustered in one group. The approach also allows estimating the speed of convergence. This latter is very important feature

since it allows accounting for the position of the long run time path of growth of an economy. The second stage involves investigating whether the role of higher education differs across economies depending on how fast these economies grow for each economy.

The remainder of this paper is organized as follows. Section 2 outlines the econometric model and introduces the PS approach. Data and the empirical results are discussed in Section 3. Section 4 concludes.

• The Econometric Model

In this section we discuss the econometric setting for this paper. In the context of this paper, we employ the neoclassical framework that captures accounts for the issue of income convergence. The standard equation employed can be defined as:

$$\Delta \log y_{it}^j = \beta_0^j + \beta_k^j \log SK_{it}^j + \beta_h^j \log SH_{it}^j + \sum_{q=1}^k \phi_q^j z_{q,it}^j + u_{it}^j \quad (1)$$

Note that the specification above is modified to account for the panel data setting (with $i=1, 2, \dots, N$ individual observed over time $t=1, 2, \dots, T$) and the position of an economy i in a steady state- or long run level- $j=1, 2, \dots, m$. Equation (1) defines economic growth per capita, $\Delta \log y$, as a function of physical capital per capita SK , human capital per capita SH and the set of additional variables z . Note that the set z contains the set of other variables that measure convergence or endogenous growth effects such as the levels of initial income, physical capital or schooling. The term u_{it} refer to residual term, which can be defined as

$$u_{it} = \alpha_i + e_{it} \quad (2)$$

where $e_{it} \sim N(0, \sigma_e^2)$ is homoscedastic with zero mean error term and α_i is individual time-invariant effect, which can be either fixed or random effects.

In order to identify the position of each economy in the long run time path of growth, we apply PS approach convergence test. The econometric model is defined as:

$$\log y_{it} = \delta_{it} \mu_t \quad (3)$$

where logged income per capita, $\log y_{it}$, is defined in a panel data model with the dependent variable observed across $i = 1, 2, \dots, N$ individuals and over time period $t = 1, 2, \dots, T$, where μ_t is growth component- common across individuals (i.e. proxy for commonly available world technology). It can also be described as a common stochastic trend in the panel data. The term, δ_{it} , refer to an individual transition factors to measure the individual economic performance in relation to the common stochastic trend, μ_t . In other words, this idiosyncratic term captures the share of common factor μ_t each individual in the panel experiences. Phillips and Sul (2007) defines this term formally as:

$$\delta_{it} = \delta_i + \sigma_i \zeta_{it} L(t)^{-1} t^{-\alpha} \quad (4)$$

where δ_i fixed, $\zeta_{it} \sim iid(0,1)$ across $i = 1, 2, \dots, N$ but weakly dependent over time. $L(t)$ is slowly varying function of time, where $L(t) \rightarrow \infty$ as $t \rightarrow \infty$. This term is key to ensure convergence towards a common long, and thus the smaller the discrepancies between $\log y_{it}$ and μ_t , the more likely the convergence is satisfied. Thus, understanding the dynamics of δ_{it} is of great importance. The above structure of the idiosyncratic term implies that the null hypothesis of convergence is accepted if for all $\alpha \geq 0$, $\delta_{it} \rightarrow \delta_i$. This implies that the analysis of convergence is around the loading coefficient, by using the relative transition coefficient, h_{it} , as a measure of the loading coefficient δ_{it} relative to the cross-sectional average in the panel.

Phillips and Sul (2007) propose the following relationship to approximate the loading coefficient, δ_{it} :

$$h_{it} = \frac{X_{it}}{N^{-1} \sum_{i=1}^N X_{it}} = \frac{\delta_{it}}{N^{-1} \sum_{i=1}^N \delta_{it}} \quad (5)$$

The convergence is then assessed based on the loading coefficient, in which PS show: if for all $\alpha \geq 0$, $\delta_{it} \rightarrow \delta_i$, then $h_{it} \rightarrow 1$ and the cross-sectional variance of h_{it} converges to zero, and we have as $t \rightarrow \infty$:

$$\sigma_t^2 = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N (h_{it} - 1)^2 \rightarrow 0 \quad (6)$$

which is a very important property and essential to test for the null of convergence and clubs of convergence.

The relative transition time path, h_{it} , captures the divergent behaviour of individuals from the common long-run path, μ_i . The PS procedure is implemented in two stages. First, PS test for the presence of overall convergence, the null hypothesis of overall convergence: $H_0: \delta_i = \delta$ and $\alpha \geq 0$, against the alternative of no convergence $H_1: \delta_i \neq \delta$ for all i , or $\alpha < 0$. If the null of convergence is rejected, then the second stage is implemented to test for the presence of clubs convergence.

The test procedure is applied to the *logt* regression, which is derived based on the cross sectional variance ratio H_1/H_t . The regression is defined as follows:

$$\log\left(\frac{H_1}{H_t}\right) - 2\log L(t) = \hat{a} + \hat{b}\log t + \hat{u}_t \quad (11)$$

where

$$H_t = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N (h_{it} - 1)^2 \quad (12)$$

$t = [rT], [rT] + \dots, T$, with $r > 0$, $L(t) = \log(t+1)$, $\hat{b} = 2\hat{\alpha}$ and $\hat{\alpha}$ is the estimated value of α in the null above, which the speed at which the time series converges to. The regression is run starting at $t = [rT]$, which is the integer part of rT for some fraction $r > 0$. PS recommend to use $r = 0.3$. Once the regression is run, the null is accepted, if the autocorrelation heteroscedasticity robust one tail t_b statistic is above the critical value, c (e.g. at 5% level of significance, fail to reject the null if $t_b \geq -1.65$). Rejection of the null does not imply that there is no convergence. It may, in fact, imply that we move to relative convergence test. In other words, we test whether there are clusters of convergence.

- **Data and Empirical Findings:**

The data we use in this paper are obtained from the World Bank and United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD). Due to the issue of data availability, we focus on only 16 MENA countries including: Algeria, Bahrain, Egypt, Iran, Iraq, Jordan, Kuwait, Lebanon, Libya, Morocco, Oman, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Tunisia, UAE and Yemen. The data covers variables measuring economic development (GDP per capita), investment (Gross Domestic Savings as a proxy for investment), Openness, and measures of higher education including research and development (R & D), innovation, start-up and entrepreneurship and skilled labour. Details on the proxies used to measure each of the factors are found on Table 2 notes below. The data for income per capita are available from the 1970s, while other data availability differs from one variable to another. The time period of choice- where all income data are available is 1990-2016. All data are annual and expressed in real terms when appropriate.

- *Clubs of Convergence:*

We apply the PS approach to the GDP per capita, which illustrated in Figure 1. Figure 1 shows income disparities across MENA economies, where Qatar is the leading economy in terms of income, while Yemen displays the lowest levels of income over the time period. This gap between rich and poor economies in MENA region seems to get wider over time as shown in Figure 2. According to the data depicted in Figure 2, economies around the median level of income show no sign of change over time and they have the tendency

to exhibit a relatively low and stable economic growth. In contrast, economies on the higher end and lower end distribution exhibit a tendency to change over time. While rich economies show a tendency to grow -at slower rate-, poor economies show significant decline in economic growth.

In relative terms, the transition curves- as defined by equation (5) above, in Figure 3 provide estimates for the time path of income across the MENA countries considered in this paper. The LR line refers to the long run level to which all economies would converge if there is an overall convergence. As shown by the data in Figure 3, the time path of all economies does not seem to converge to the overall long run level. Instead some economies display the tendency to grow faster and higher over time (e.g. Qatar), while other show tendency to decline over time (e.g. Yemen and Libya). The overall convergence test reported in Table 1 reports the rejection of the null hypothesis of overall convergence, and thus we conclude that income per capita across the MENA economies does not move to the same level in the long run.

Table 1 also reports the tests statistics for the presence of clubs of convergence. According to the findings in Table 1, there are three clubs of convergence and one divergent club. The formation of clubs suggest that the economies in Club 1 converge to the equilibrium at faster rate than the members of Club 2, but slower than those economies in Club 3. Qatar and Yemen do not converge to any of the estimated steady states. Qatar, as the data shows, is leading the MENA economies and appears to drift away to higher levels than the rest of the economies, while Yemen's income is found to be in significant decline over time relative to the rest of the economies (e.g. Figure 3). Figure 4 illustrates the composition of the clubs estimated and their time path. There is a significant gap between the club of rich economies and those located in the second and third club. This shows the persistence of the gap between MENA economies over time.

- *Growth Model Panel Estimates:*

In this section, we report the results of estimating specification (1) accounting for the time path of each economy. Table 2 reports the estimation output and provide detailed notes on the estimator, the models, and post estimation inference. We adopt two variations of the specification: the Basic Model and Extended Model. The Basic model is the restricted form of the specification in (1), which allows only for measures of investment, higher education and initial income. The Basic Model is estimated for the whole panel, without accounting for the time path for robustness check purposes. The model is also estimated accounting for the time path of each group of convergent economies. This means that Qatar and Yemen are dropped from the regressions. In general, all specifications considered for this model

suggest that higher education, as measured by the rate of tertiary education enrolment, have positive and statistically significant impact on economic growth, though the marginal effect is very small. This implies that higher education does not have strong impact on economic growth (between 0.1% and 0.4%). The exception is the economies in Club 1, where higher education is found to have the wrong sign and statistically insignificant impact. The models are all highly significant and better fitted with the Fixed Effects model.

Similar econometric exercise is carried out on the Extended Model. The conclusions, however, are in complete contrast with the Basic Model. First the role of higher education is only significant for Club 1 but with the wrong sign suggesting that higher education may have a negative impact on economic growth for the Gulf countries. Other factors of innovation, R & D and entrepreneurship are mostly insignificant except for Club 3 countries where innovation is significant with negative sign. This again contradicts the expected outcome.

One key issue with these regressions is the poor quality of the data. The data sets available, especially for the developing economies, are full of missing values leading sample size distortion and hence lack of variations. This issue is often the cause of rejecting models that are, otherwise highly plausible. This issue is often raised in the literature and often caused many models to be rejected and erroneously producing misleading or fragile conclusions (e.g. Aghion *et al* (2009), Cohen and Soto (2007)).

- **Concluding Remarks:**

The present paper deals with the issue of the role of higher education in economic performance. The main hypothesis of the paper is to attribute the role of the higher education to the speed at which economies grow. Unlike the literature, we proceed by exploring the issue of income convergence to locate the position of the economies in our sample in the long run time path. By applying the concept of clubs of convergence, we find evidence that per capita income in the MENA economies does not converge to a unique steady state. This also identified a widening gap over time where rich economies seem to fluctuate farther up, while poor economies experience a decline in their economies. This work, in the context of income convergence, is not aimed to explain these dynamics since it is beyond the scope of the paper.

Based on the evidence in section 3, we find evidence that higher education may play an important role for economies with low growth rates and have a relatively slow to moderate speed of convergence. This is in contrast with the economies that are found to be fast growing. There are very weak evidence that support a wider contribution of the other components of higher education such as innovation and R & D. This, by no means, implies that there is no positive role of innovation and R & D. The lack of evidence

may be attributed to issues concerning data availability and their quality. This case is often faced by researchers in the literature. Thus, one needs to be cautious in drawing conclusions for academic and policy purposes.

Table 1: Clubs of Convergence Tests Results

Test	Test Statistics
Overall Test	$\hat{t} = -30.950^* \hat{\alpha} = -0.231$
Club 1	$\hat{t} = 4.159 \hat{\alpha} = 0.281$ [BEH, KUW, SAU, UAE]
Club 2	$\hat{t} = 0.616 \hat{\alpha} = 0.02$ [IRAN, IRAQ, LEB, MOR, OMAN, TUN]
Club 3	$\hat{t} = 4.900 \hat{\alpha} = 0.354 \hat{\alpha} = 0.351$ [ALG, EGY, JOR, LIB]
Divergent Club	$\hat{t} = -27.974^* \hat{\alpha} = -0.471$ [QAT], [YEM]

Results above are based on trimming rate equal to 0.3. $\hat{t}$: is the estimated t statistic and $\hat{\alpha}$: is the speed of convergence. (*) indicates the rejection of the null of convergence at 5% level of significance (i.e. t critical value is -1.65). The null hypothesis states that there is overall convergence. We need both, the null to hold and the positive sign of the speed of convergence $\hat{\alpha}$. If the latter is negative, then equation (4) above will not converge to the cross sectional level. Divergent Club implies that both Yemen and Qatar do not converge to any of the clubs. The tests conducted on the time period 1990-2016 due to missing data (Yemen data are available from 1990).

Table 1: Panel estimated of the growth model in equation (1).

	Basic Model			
Variables	Panel	Club 1	Club 2	Club 3
Investment	-5.17e-12	8.36e-08*	-3.45e-11***	1.96e-09
Higher Education	0.002*	-0.001	0.004**	0.001*
Initial Income	-0.234*	-0.529*	-0.196*	-0.101*
Entrepreneurship				
Innovation				
R & D				
Openness				
Constant	1.95*	5.177*	1.506	0.761
R^2	0.25	0.86	0.10	0.192
F	7.59*	157.94*	2.38**	3.12**
Hausman Test	81.96*	N.A.	9.15**	9.44*
T	258	54	99	71

Estimation method: IV estimator since the model suffers from endogeneity. The set of instruments include lagged dependent variable and lagged endogenous variables. Basic model includes the variables: Investment (measured by domestic savings), Higher Education (measured by the proportion of students in tertiary education) and Initial Income (measured by lagged log per capita income). Extended Model extends the Basic Model with additional variables including: Entrepreneurship (measured by the start-up indicator: the number of patents obtained by residents), Innovation (measured by High Tech exports as ratio of all manufacturing exports), R & D (measured as number of scientific technical papers published in academic journals) and Openness (measured as the sum of exports and imports divided by the GDP and expressed in logged terms). The sample covers the time period 1990-2016. Missing values handled by using statistical interpolation when appropriate. When interpolation is not possible, the missing values are dropped out of the sample. Club 1, Club 2 and Club 3 refer to the panels estimated accounting for the economy's position on the long run time path. The R^2 is within effects R^2 . The F statistic tests the null that all the fixed effects are jointly insignificant. The Hausman test is employed to choose the model to report, Fixed Effect or Random Effect. The null hypothesis of this test stated that the appropriate model is Random Effect. Rejecting the null implies that the appropriate model is Fixed Effect. (*), (**) and (***) refer to significance at 1%, 5% and 10% levels. T is the useable sample size. N.A. refers to the case when the Hausman test fails to meet the asymptotic assumptions. χ^2 refer to the Wald statistic. It tests for the joint significance of the model. The null states that the model is jointly insignificant. It is reported only when the model is a Random Effect model. (*****) the variable dropped due to perfect collinearity.

References

- Aghion, P. Boustan, L. Hoxby, C. and Vandenbussche, J. (2009). *The causal impact of education on economic growth: Evidence from U.S.* Brookings Papers on Economic Activity. Spring 2009, Conference Draft.
- Baddeley, M., McNay, K. & Cassen, R. (2006) *Divergence in India: Income differentials at the state level*, *Journal of Development Studies*, 42(6), pp.1000-1022.
- Barrell, R., Holland, D., Liadze, I. (2010). *Accounting for UK economic performance 1973-2009*. National Institute of Economic and Social Research, NIESR Discussion Paper No. 359.
- Barro, R.J. & Sala-i-Martin, X. (1992) Convergence, *Journal of Political Economy*, 100(2), pp.223-
- Benhabib, J., and Spiegel, M.M. (1994). *The role of human capital in economic development: Evidence from aggregate cross-country data*. *Journal of Monetary Economics*, 34(2), pp: 143–173.
- Benos, N. and Zotou, S. (2013). *Education and economic growth: A meta-regression analysis*. MPRA Paper No 46143.
- Bils, M. and Klenow, P. (2000). *Does schooling cause growth?* *American Economic Review*, 90, pp: 1160-1183.
- Chatterjee, M. (1992) *Convergence clubs and endogenous growth*, *Oxford Review of Economic Policy*, 8(4), pp.43-56.
- Cohen, D., and Soto, M. (2007). *Growth and human capital: Good data, good results*. *Journal of Economic Growth*, 12, pp: 51-76.
- De la Fuente, A., and Domenech, R. (2002). *Educational attainment in the OECD, 1960–1995*. CEPR DP 3390.
- De la Fuente, A., and Domenech, R. (2006). *Human capital in growth regression: How much difference does quality data make?* *Journal of the European Economic Association*, 4(1), 1–36. An earlier version was published in CEPR DP 2466 (2000)
- Gemmell, N. (1996). *Evaluating the impacts of human capital stocks and accumulation on economic growth: some new evidence*. *Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics*, 58 (1), pp: 9-28.
- Holland, D. Liadze, I, Rienzo, C. and Wilkinson, D. (2013). *The relationship between graduates and economic growth across countries*. National Institute of Economic and Social Research. BIS Research Paper No. 110.
- Holmes, C. (2013). *Has the expansion of higher education led to greater economic growth?* *National Institute Economic Review*, No 224.

- Judson, R. (1998). *Economic growth and investment in education: How allocations matters*. *Journal of Economic Growth*, 3 (4), pp: 337-359.
- Krueger, A., and Lindahl, M. (2001). *Education for growth: Why and for whom?*. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 39(4), 1101–1136.
- Kruss, G., McGrath, S., Petersen, I., and Gastrow, M. (2015). *Higher education and economic development: The importance of building technological capabilities*. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 43, pp: 22-31.
- Mankiw, G., Romer, D., and Weil, D. (1992). *A contribution to the empirics of economic growth*. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 107(2), pp:402–437.
- Phillips, P.C.B., & Sul, D. (2007) *Transition modeling and econometric convergence tests*, *Econometrica*, 75 (6), pp 1771–1855.
- Pillay, P. (2010). *Higher education and economic development: Literature review*. Centre for Higher Education Transformation.
- Quah, D. (1997) *Empirics for Growth and Distribution: Stratification, Polarization and Convergence Clubs*, *Journal of Economic Growth*, 2 (1), pp.27-59.