

Equilibrium : «Africa's Diplomatic Strides in United Nation Security Council Restructuring »

التوازن العالمي : "الخطوات الدبلوماسية التي قطعتها أفريقيا في إعادة هيكلة مجلس الأمن التابع للأمم المتحدة"



Dr Zaki Lounaouci , z.lounaouci@univ-dbkm.dz¹

¹ Djilali Bounaama university, Civil status system laboratory



Received 03/02/2024

Accepted: 22/04/2024

Published:30 /06/2024

Abstract :

This article explores the imperative for African representation in the UNSC, analysing geopolitical shifts, demographic importance, and economic contributions. It delves into the strategic evolution of the A3, highlighting the Oran Process as a pivotal event. Addressing challenges in reform, counterarguments, historical contexts, and potential divisions among African nations are critically examined. The path forward involves inclusive and transparent discussions, clear criteria for permanent membership, fostering collaboration, and exploring mechanisms to address the impact of veto power.transformative deplomacy emerge qs the guiding principle in navigating security council lreform.

Key words : Security Council, Veto Right, Africa's Diplomacy .

ملخص: تهدف هذه الدراسة الى تسليط الضوء حول ضرورة التمثيل الافريقي في مجلس الامن التابع للأمم المتحدة في ظل التحولات الجيوسياسية و الاهمية الديموغرافية و المساهمات الاقتصادية والتطورات الاستراتيجية،كم تسليط هذه الورقة البحثية الضوء على ندوة وهران التي تعتبر فرصة للوقوف على ما تم قطعه من اشواط وما ينتظر من جهود ، وهذا من خلال المحور الاول ، في حين يتم فحص ومعالجة التحديات التي تواجه هذه الاصلاحات ،و الحجج المضادة و السياق التاريخي و الانقسامات المحتملة بين الدول الافريقية من خلال المحور الثاني .

ان المسار نحو الامام على مناقشات شاملة وشفافة ومعايير واضحة للعضوية الدائمة وكذا تعزيز التعاون واستكشاف الآليات اللازمة لمعالجة تأثير حق النقض يبرز من خلال الدبلوماسية التحولية باعتبارها المبدأ التوجيهي في عملية اصلاح مجلس الامن الكلمات المفتاحية. مجلس الامن، حق الفيتو، افريقيا، الدبلوماسية التحولية.

1- Corresponding author: Dr Lounaouci Zaki, e-mail: z.lounaouci@univ-dbkm.dz

INTRODUCTION

In the realm of global governance, the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) stands as a bastion of decision-making, yet its composition has long been criticized for inadequacies that undermine its effectiveness. Of particular concern is the absence of permanent representation from Africa, a continent intricately linked to the UN's activities. This article delves into the imperative for African representation, navigating through geopolitical shifts, demographic significance, and economic contributions. The Oran Process and the strategic evolution of the African three members of the UNSC (A3) offer valuable insights into the ongoing transformation. As we explore the challenges and resolutions in reforming the Security Council, counterarguments, historical contexts, and potential divisions among African nations come to the fore. A path forward involves inclusive and transparent discussions, clear criteria for permanent membership, fostering collaboration among African nations, and exploring mechanisms to address the impact of veto power. This article critically examines these facets, offering a comprehensive understanding of the complex dynamics surrounding Security Council reform.

The Security Council's current composition, marked by a lack of permanent representation from Africa, raises serious questions about its legitimacy and effectiveness in addressing global challenges. Geopolitical power imbalances, uncertainties in selecting specific African countries, and resistance to altering the existing dynamics create a pressing problematic (1). The article seeks to address these challenges, advocating for a transformative approach to diplomacy that recognizes Africa's growing influence and endeavors to reform the Security Council for a more inclusive and equitable international order.

1. The imperative for african representation

1.1.Currente Disparities in the Ssecurity Council and critiques:

Analyzing the existing structure of the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) reveals a composition that is fraught with imbalances, marked by the dominance of a select few nations, particularly the Permanent Five (P5) - China, France, Russia, the United Kingdom, and the United States. This concentration of power within a limited group has raised significant concerns about the representation and inclusivity of the Council in addressing global issues(2).

The P5, endowed with veto powers, exercise disproportionate influence over decision-making processes, often leading to outcomes that reflect their specific geopolitical interests. The absence of permanent African representation exacerbates this power imbalance, as the Council fails to capture the diversity of

perspectives and experiences crucial for crafting effective and equitable international policies .(3)

This disparity is vividly illustrated in statements from African leaders at the UN General Assembly, where calls for urgent UNSC reform resound. Leaders emphasize the need for a more democratic and representative Council that reflects the geopolitical realities of the 21st century. These statements underscore the tangible impacts of the current imbalance on decision-making processes within the UNSC (4).

African nations advocating UNSC reform are guided by the "Ezulwini Consensus" and "the Sirte Declaration." These frameworks represent a collective effort to articulate the demands of the African continent for a fair and just representation within the Security Council. The "Ezulwini Consensus" originated in Eswatini in 2005, articulating Africa's position on UNSC reform, including the call for two permanent seats with veto powers for African nations. The "Sirte Declaration," adopted in Libya in 2005, further solidified this position, emphasizing the importance of African unity in pressing for reform(5).

- ***Importance of Representation (Approx. 2 pages)***

Effective representation within international institutions is pivotal for their legitimacy and functionality. The current lack of adequate African representation in the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) significantly hampers its ability to comprehensively address global challenges. This section explores the critical importance of representation, drawing insights from Mr.

Lamamra's speech at the ministerial meeting in Brazzaville, highlighting recent developments and commitments toward fostering a more representative, fair, and balanced international order (6).

The legitimacy of international institutions depends on their capacity to represent the diversity of member nations. In the case of the UNSC, where decisions have far-reaching global consequences, inclusive perspectives are imperative. The current absence of adequate representation from Africa not only raises questions about the Council's legitimacy but also introduces a significant imbalance in its decision-making processes.

- **Public Perceptions and Calls for Reform :**

The clamor for urgent reforms within the Security Council echoes a prevalent dissatisfaction among the global public with its current composition. Central to this discourse is the article "Why Africa Deserves a Permanent Seat on the United Nations Security Council" by DWC Uganda, encapsulating the prevailing sentiment and articulating compelling arguments for reform (7). This piece meticulously outlines the geopolitical, economic, and demographic factors underpinning Africa's rightful claim to a permanent seat, resonating with a growing chorus demanding substantive transformations.

1.2.Geopolitical, Demographic, and Economic Significance

- **Geopolitical Shifts**

Africa's role in the international arena has undergone significant transformations, marked by dynamic geopolitical shifts that

demand a reevaluation of global governance structures. The continent, once marginalized, is increasingly asserting its influence on the world stage. This shift is evident in diplomatic engagements, trade partnerships, and peacekeeping efforts. As noted by Paterson and Virk (2013), Africa's two terms on the UN Security Council reflect its evolving diplomatic strategies and voting patterns, signifying a proactive approach to international relations (8).

Africa's growing influence is particularly notable in conflict resolution and peacekeeping initiatives. The A3 (African three members of the UN Security Council) has emerged as a formidable collective entity, as seen in the Oran Process. Originating from the divergent policy positions during the Libyan crisis, the A3 has evolved into a power block with substantial influence in UNSC decision-making (9). The geopolitical dynamics reflect a recalibration of power, emphasizing the need for a more inclusive and representative Security Council.

- **Demographic Importance:**

Africa's demographic significance as the second-most populous continent amplifies its importance in global affairs. With 54 member states in the UN, Africa's demographic weight manifests in its diverse cultures, languages, and socioeconomic conditions. The demographic realities of Africa, as discussed by Maurel (2022), underscore the imperative for better representation in the UN Security Council (10). The continent's burgeoning youth population adds a dynamic dimension to international relations,

emphasizing the need for policies that consider the aspirations and challenges faced by African youth.

The potential implications of Africa's demographic weight on decision-making processes are multifaceted. A youth-driven demographic dividend presents opportunities for innovation, economic growth, and collaborative global initiatives. However, it also poses challenges related to unemployment, education, and healthcare that necessitate comprehensive and inclusive policymaking.

The significance of Africa's demographics extends beyond national borders. The interconnectedness of global challenges, such as climate change, pandemics, and migration, requires a Security Council that reflects the demographic realities of the 21st century(11). The perspectives and priorities of African nations, driven by their demographic composition, contribute to a holistic understanding of these challenges.

2. Challenges and Resolutions in Reforming the Security Council

In the second chapter of our exploration, we confront the multifaceted challenges entwined with the reformative journey of the United Nations Security Council (UNSC). This section meticulously dissects counterarguments and challenges, dissecting the complexities that impede the realization of a more representative and responsive international order.

2.1 Counterarguments and Challenges

- **Counterarguments :**

counterarguments that warrant careful consideration. Critics often express concerns about potential power imbalances, arguing that expanding the Council may lead to inefficiency. The call for African representation in the UN Security Council faces several and gridlock. The fear is that with more members, decision-making could become cumbersome, hindering the Council's ability to respond swiftly to global crises (12).

Furthermore, uncertainties arise regarding the selection of specific African countries for permanent representation. Skeptics question how these countries would be chosen and whether such a selection process could lead to favoritism or geopolitical tensions. The counterargument suggests that the ambiguity in the criteria for choosing representative nations may undermine the legitimacy and effectiveness of the Security Council .

- **Historical Context of Veto Power**

Understanding the historical context of the veto power within the Security Council is crucial in evaluating the challenges associated with its potential reform. The veto power, granted to the P5 nations after World War II, was designed to maintain global stability by preventing any single nation or alliance from dominating international decision-making (13). However, this power has been both a stabilizing and contentious force in the Council's history.

The veto power has often been exercised to protect national interests, leading to instances where decisive action was impeded.

The historical overview provided by the speakers at the 9410th meeting in September 2023 emphasized the need for more transparency and inclusivity in the Council's working methods . The resistance to altering the veto power is rooted in the belief that it provides a necessary check and balance mechanism(14).

2.2 A Path Forward: Building Consensus and Mitigating Challenges

As we navigate through the complexities of Security Council reform, Section 2 emerges as a beacon of hope, outlining a constructive path forward. This section delves into the strategies and initiatives aimed at fostering consensus while effectively mitigating the challenges hindering the transformative evolution of the United Nations Security Council (UNSC).

- **Inclusive and Transparent Discussions:**

Advocating for Security Council reform necessitates fostering inclusive and transparent discussions among UN member states. The dialogue should involve a broad spectrum of stakeholders, including both permanent and non-permanent members, regional organizations, and civil society. Transparency ensures that diverse perspectives are considered, contributing to the legitimacy and acceptance of any proposed reforms.

Inclusivity in these discussions can be achieved through open forums, roundtable discussions, and inclusive working groups. Regional consultations, as discussed in the 9410th meeting in September 2023, could provide a platform for member states to voice their concerns and aspirations (15). By engaging all

stakeholders, the UN can tap into a wealth of diverse experiences and viewpoints, making the reform process more comprehensive and responsive to the needs of the global community.

Transparent discussions involve sharing information on proposed reforms, decision-making processes, and the rationale behind each step. Transparency enhances accountability and reduces skepticism or resistance. The recent emphasis on transparency and inclusivity in the Council's working methods underscores the growing recognition of the importance of these principles in achieving effective reform (16).

- **Clear Criteria for Permanent Membership:**

To address concerns about the uncertainty of selecting specific African countries for permanent seats, proposing clear and objective criteria becomes paramount. The establishment of well-defined criteria ensures that the selection process is based on merit, taking into account each nation's contributions to global peace, security, and development.

Criteria may include a demonstrated commitment to conflict resolution, active participation in UN peacekeeping missions, and substantial contributions to humanitarian efforts. Economic stability, respect for human rights, and adherence to international law could also be integral factors. The call for clear criteria echoes sentiments expressed during the General Debate in September 2023(17).

The criteria should be formulated through collaborative efforts, with input from member states, regional organizations, and

experts in international relations. A transparent process for establishing these criteria fosters confidence in the selection process and ensures that it aligns with the broader goals of the UN(18).

• **Fostering Collaboration Among African Nations:**

Collaboration among African nations is fundamental to building consensus on representation within the Security Council. The continent's diversity requires a unified approach that transcends historical divisions and regional differences. Establishing a common agenda and shared objectives can be achieved through diplomatic efforts, regional summits, and collaborative initiatives. Regional organizations, such as the African Union (AU), play a pivotal role in fostering collaboration. The AU's existing frameworks, such as the "Ezulwini Consensus" and "the Sirte Declaration," provide a foundation for building a united African stance on Security Council reform . Regular consultations and dialogues, as emphasized in the 9410th meeting in September 2023, can serve as platforms for addressing potential divisions and forging a cohesive approach (19).

Benefits of regional collaboration extend beyond the reform process, contributing to enhanced regional stability, economic development, and shared security responsibilities. By fostering a sense of solidarity, African nations can present a stronger collective voice, making a compelling case for their representation within the Security Council.

CONCLUSION

In summary, the call for African representation within the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) transcends regional interests, emerging as a global imperative. Acknowledging Africa's burgeoning influence in international affairs, driven by demographic significance and economic contributions, highlights the urgent need for Security Council reform. While challenges persist, the roadmap to a reformed UNSC involves inclusive dialogues, clear criteria, regional collaboration, and innovative mechanisms. Fundamentally, transformative diplomacy must underpin these efforts, ensuring that the Security Council evolves to reflect the diverse voices and interests of the global community. While the journey towards a reformed Security Council is intricate, its ultimate destination promises a more just and representative international order.

Marginalization

1. Deputy Speaker of Parliament - Thomas Tayebwa's call for UNSC reforms.Reference Link: <https://coufamilytv.co.ug/story/deputy-speaker-tayebwa-pushes-for-reforms-in-the-un-security-council> (consulted on 12/12/2023).

2.Statements from African leaders at the UN General Assembly <https://news.un.org/en/story/2023/09/1141162> (consulted on 12/12/2023).

3."Ezulwini Consensus" and "the Sirte Declaration" - Frameworks guiding African nations in UNSC reform.

Reference Link:<https://www.mfa.gov.dz/press-and-information/news-and-press-releases/mr-lamamra-takes-part-in-au-10-ministerial-meeting-on-un-security-council-reform> (consulted on 14/12/2023).

4.Speech by Mr. Lamamra at the ministerial meeting in Brazzaville - Insights into recent developments and commitments.Reference Link:

<https://www.dwcug.org/why-africa-deserves-a-permanent-seat-on-united-nations-security-council> (consulted on 14/12/2023).

5. "Why Africa Deserves a Permanent Seat on United Nations Security Council. DWC Uganda." Reference Link: <https://www.dwcug.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Volume-0002-OCTOBER-.pdf> (consulted on 14/12/2023).

6. Africa's quest for reform of the United Nations Security Council. Accord Analysis. Reference Link: carnegieendowment.org/2023/06/28/un-security-council-reform-what-world-thinks-pub-90032 (consulted on 14/12/2023)

7. Amani Africa Report - How Africa is Using the A3 as a De Facto Permanent Power Block in Global Peace and Security Decision-making.] <https://amaniafrica-et.org/how-africa-is-using-the-a3-as-a-de-facto-permanent-power-block-in-global-peace-and-security-decision-making> (consulted on 18/12/2023).

8. Security Council Must Be More Transparent, Inclusive to Address Conflicts, Crises, Speakers Stress in Open Debate on 15-Nation Organ's Working Methods. Reference Link: <https://press.un.org/en/2023/sc15401.doc.htm> (consulted on 18/12/2023).

9. Schwoebel, M. (2011). State-Building and Democracy. University for Peace. Reference Link: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41341196> (consulted on 18/12/2023).

13. Core. (n.d.). [PDF] State-Building and Democracy. Reference Link: https://www.academia.edu/38389399/State_Building_and_Democracy (consulted on 16/12/2023).

10. Press, D. (n.d.). The Security Council Veto: A Necessary Evil? Reference Link: <https://apps.dtic.mil/sti/tr/pdf/ADA456586.pdf> (consulted on 07/12/2024).

11. Security Council Must Be More Transparent, Inclusive to Address Conflicts, Crises, Speakers Stress in Open Debate on 15-Nation Organ's

- | Working | Methods. | Reference | Link: |
|---------|----------|--|--|
| | | | https://press.un.org/en/2023/sc15401.doc.html (consulted on 07/12/2024). |
| | | 12.Stewart Patrick, Sithembile Mbete, Matias Spektor, Zhang Guihong, Alexandra Novosseloff, Christoph Heusgen, Rohan Mukherjee, Phillip Y. Lipsky, Miguel Ruiz Cabañas Izquierdo, Adekeye Adebajo, Andrey Kolosovskiy, Joel Ng, Priyal Singh, Barçin Yinanc, Richard Gowan, Anjali Dayal. (June 28, 2023). "UN Security Council Reform: What the World Thinks." Carnegie Endowment for International Peace. Link | |
| | | | https://carnegieendowment.org/2023/06/28/un-security-council-reform-what-world-thinks-pub-90032 (consulted on 01/12/2024). |
| | | 13.Osita G. Afoaku and Okechukwu Ukaga. (Fall, 2001). "United Nations Security Council Reform: A Critical Analysis of Enlargement Options." Journal of Third World Studies, Vol. 18, No. 2, pp. 149-169. University of Florida Press. | |
| | | 14.Ibid p154. | |
| | | 15.Abubakar Abdulkadir Alkali. "An Appraisal of Africa’s Aspirations for Permanent membership of the UN Security Council: A Case Study of Nigeria’s Prospects and Challenges." Candidate number: C1656395. Cardiff University. | Link : |
| | | | https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/152243/1/2022AlkaliAPhD.pdf (consulted on 01/12/2024). |
| | | 16.Sabina Henneberg. "Algeria Takes a Seat on the UN Security Council." The Washington Institute. | Link |
| | | | https://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/algeria-takes-seat-un-security-counci (consulted on 10/12/2024). |
| | | 17."African Calls for Representation at UN Signify 'Isolation': Analysts." VOA Africa. Link : | |
| | | | https://www.voaafrica.com/a/african-calls-representation-un-/6767652.html (consulted on 10/12/2024). |

18."Security Council Reform: The United Nations." Global Policy Forum. Link : [https ://press.un.org/en/2007/ga10621.doc.html](https://press.un.org/en/2007/ga10621.doc.html) (consulted on 11/12/2024).

19.(November 16, 2000). "Opinion on Security Council Reform Offered by Thirty-Nine More Member States as Assembly Debate Continues." Press Release GA/9825. United Nations. Link <https://press.un.org/en/2000/20001116.ga9825.doc.html> (consulted on 10/12/2024).

Bibliography List :

Books :

1. Stewrt Patrick, Sithembile Mbete, Matias Spektor, Zhang Guihong, Alexandra Novosseloff, Christoph Heusgen, Rohan Mukherjee, Phillip Y. Lipsky, Miguel Ruiz Cabañas Izquierdo, Adekeye Adebajo, Andrey Kolosovskiy, Joel Ng, Priyal Singh, Barçin Yinanc, Richard Gowan, Anjali Dayal. (June 28, 2023). "UN Security Council Reform: What the World Thinks." Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.

Internet websites:

1. Parliament of Uganda - Africa Deserves Permanent Seats in UN Security Council
2. CouFamily TV - Deputy Speaker Tayebwa's Call for UNSC Reforms
3. UN News - Statements from African Leaders at the UN General Assembly
4. Ministerial Meeting in Brazzaville - Mr. Lamamra's Speech
DWC Uganda - Why Africa Deserves a Permanent Seat on the UNSC.

Articles:

Osita G. Afoaku and Okechukwu Ukaga. (Fall, 2001). "United Nations Security Council Reform: A Critical Analysis of Enlargement Options." Journal of Third World Studies, Vol. 18, No. 2, pp. 149-169. University of Florida Press.

"Opinion on Security Council Reform Offered by Thirty-Nine More Member States as Assembly Debate Continues." Press Release GA/9825. United Nations.

Abubakar Abdulkadir Alkali. "An Appraisal of Africa's Aspirations for Permanent Membership of the UN Security Council: A Case Study of Nigeria's Prospects and Challenges."

Sabina Henneberg. "Algeria Takes a Seat on the UN Security Council." The Washington Institute.

"African Calls for Representation at UN Signify 'Isolation': Analysts." VOA Africa

"Security Council Reform: The United Nations." Global Policy Forum.

"Kenya's President Calls UN Security Council 'Undemocratic, Dysfunctional'." Anadolu Agency (2022). "UN Security Council Reform." UNIS Vienna (Year not mentioned). "Security Council Reform Including Its Membership." Sage Journals